

**Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board (TDLCB)
Meeting Minutes
July 14, 2021**

Volusia County Mobility Management Center
950 Big Tree Road, South Daytona, FL 32119

TDLCB Members Physically Present:

Clayton Jackson
Jean Cerullo
Renee Gahagan
Doug Hall
Christy Gillis
Mary Tyson
Carlos Colón
Ethan Johnson
Robert Watson

Representing:

Association of Community Action
Citizens Advocate
Citizens Advocate - Alternate
Citizens Advocate, System User
Department of Children and Families – Alternate
Disabled Citizens - Alternate
Florida Department of Transportation
Medical Community - Alternate
Veterans Services Group

TDLCB Members Virtually Present:

Sheryl Dick-Stanford
Judy Craig, Vice Chairperson
Patricia Lipovsky
Victoria Anderson
Steve Jack
Susan Pauly
Barbara Girtman, Chairperson

Representing:

Agency for Persons with Disabilities
Disabled Citizens
Elderly Citizens
Health Care Administration
Private for Profit
Vocational Rehab Services
Volusia County Council, District 1

TDLCB Members Absent:

Beverly Johnson (excused)
Gladys Lacen
Bill Hinkle, Jr.
Kathy Spencer (excused)

Representing:

Children at Risk
Elder Affairs
Public Education
Workforce Development Board - Alternate

Others Physically Present:

Debbie Stewart, Recording Secretary
Stephan Harris
Suzanne Kridner
Big John
Sarah Goolsby
Ralf Heseler
Kelvin Miller
John Cotton
Jake Lunceford
Glenn Scorza
Edie Biro

Representing:

TPO Staff
TPO Staff
Citizen
Press
Tindale-Oliver and Associates
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff

Others Virtually Present:

Lois Bollenback
Colleen Nicoulin

Representing:

TPO Staff
TPO Staff

I. Call t/o Order / Roll Call / Determination of Quorum/Pledge of Allegiance

Due to the COVID-19 virus, the meeting was held in a hybrid format with nine voting members physically present and seven voting members virtually present.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Mr. Hall to allow TDLCB members attending remotely due to COVID-19 precautions to participate and vote. The motion was seconded by Ms. Cerullo and carried unanimously.*

II. Public Comment/Participation

Mr. Big John, press, stated we have a minor victory; on next week's Volusia County Council agenda with \$100,000 from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) for sample projects for bus stop benches, trash cans, bike racks, shelters and like items. There is Sample Project 1A for \$9,100, Sample Project 1B for \$9,800, Sample Project 2A for \$4,100, Sample Project 2B for \$3,800, Sample Project 3, for \$49,000 and Sample Project 4 for \$12,100. The contract was awarded to A.G. Pifer Construction Company of Daytona Beach. He has spoken to Ms. Bobbie King, Community Services Operations Manager of Votran, who will let him know what those sample projects are as there is no explanation in the agenda. He also spoke with Ms. King on another way to go which is to contract with private companies like Creative Outdoor Advertising; they installed 62 bus stop benches and three shelters for free in Daytona Beach. As a result, the county is working on a proposal to go out for bid to private companies to install bus stop benches along corridors such as US 92. He hopes this board will do something to encourage the county to pursue private companies that will exponentially increase the bus stop benches in unincorporated Volusia County; the city of Daytona Beach has done this and it has worked out well.

Chairperson Girtman replied that she looks forward to the feedback from staff on their due diligence regarding private companies; who is available and what it will look like.

III. Action Items

A. Review and Approval of the April 14, 2021 TDLCB Meeting Minutes

MOTION: *A motion was made by Ms. Gillis to approve the April 14, 2021 TDLCB meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hall and carried unanimously.*

B. Review and Approval of the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) Monthly Paratransit Reports

Mr. Heseler stated the March, April and May 2021 paratransit trips as compared to 2020 are on the rise; last year, COVID-19 reduced paratransit trips significantly but they are now back on the rise as reflected in the reports. Additionally, the Flex service report numbers are also on the rise. He reminded members that Votran had service changes in June to Routes 24 and 44; he expects to see paratransit trips in the Pierson area go up as a result. He will have a Flex service route update at the next meeting.

Chairperson Girtman asked if Votran had compared the 2019 reports to 2021.

Mr. Heseler replied that information is not reflected in the reports but it can be brought forward at the next meeting or earlier if requested.

Chairperson Girtman commented she is curious to see if ridership is back to capacity.

Mr. Heseler replied not yet but it is nearing capacity.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Mr. Watson to approve the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) Paratransit Reports. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hall and carried unanimously.*

C. Review and Approval of the 2021 Major Update to the Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP) (Roll Call Vote Required)

Mr. Harris stated last October, Votran kicked off an eleven-month project to update the Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP) as well as the Transit Development Plan (TDP) and Comprehensive Operations

Analysis (COA). He introduced Ms. Sarah Goolsby, Tindale-Oliver and Associates, to discuss the major update to the TDSP.

Ms. Goolsby gave a PowerPoint presentation of the major update to the Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP) for years 2022 through 2026; the last major update was completed in 2017 for years 2018 through 2022. The TDSP is a tactical and policy plan that includes a development plan, service plan, quality assurance and cost/revenue allocations and fare justifications. A new TDSP is developed every five years with an annual update for each year in between. It is developed by the Community Transportation Coordinator (Votran) and the planning agency (TPO), reviewed and approved by the TDLCB and then submitted to the Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD). She reviewed the two major components to the TDSP; the development plan and the service plan. Votran's Transit Development Plan (TDP) was being developed at the same time as the TDSP so there was a joint public participation process; two public workshops were held as well as four discussion group workshops with participants from a variety of stakeholder agencies. Also, 53 Votran Gold customers were contacted to complete a phone survey. She reviewed key findings from the public participation including that overall, customers are satisfied with Votran Gold service and that 26% would consider riding fixed route if it was easily accessible. A trend analysis was also conducted to look at performance measures between 2016 and 2020 but because the COVID-19 pandemic skewed the 2020 numbers, they also looked at 2016 to 2019 numbers. Several performance measures stayed relatively the same; however, there was an increased operating expense per passenger trip and vehicle miles that may indicate a need for improved efficiency. They also reviewed demographic and land use trends which showed the poverty rate has slightly decreased since 2010; the population with a disability in Volusia County is 18% which is higher than the statewide average; that trend suggests there will be an increased demand for transportation for the senior and disabled populations. Transportation needs and barriers were also identified which include difficulty to meet the demand for Sunday service due to competing priorities; difficulty in paratransit driver recruitment and that new service is needed to accommodate individuals residing more than the three-quarters of a mile from a fixed route service where new residential and commercial development is taking place means more people may be eligible for the TD program. They developed key strategies to address these needs which include a phased implementation plan to improve accessibility at bus stop locations; complete an analysis of TD bus pass programs to determine the efficiency of the programs in reducing paratransit trip demand; and develop a driver recruitment program and training initiative to attract new paratransit operators. The next step will be to submit the TDSP to the Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD) after the TDLCB approves it today.

Chairperson Girtman stated she had a lengthy interview at the beginning of this process where ideas and recommendations were discussed; she was expecting something more visionary.

Ms. Goolsby replied that interview was part of the Transit Development Plan (TDP). She explained the TDP is more for the fixed route and paratransit services and the TDSP is directed towards the transportation disadvantaged population. The TDP is a separate report that is currently being developed.

Chairperson Girtman asked if the TDSP is a part of the TDP.

Ms. Goolsby replied no, not traditionally; however, Votran is developing the plans at the same time. Some elements are shared but they are separate plans.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Ms. Gahagan to approve the 2021 major update to the Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP). The motion was seconded by Mr. Watson and carried unanimously by a roll call vote.*

D. Review and Approval of the TDLCB Bylaws

Mr. Harris stated a marked draft of the TDLCB Bylaws was provided in the agenda. In 2019, the TDLCB quorum was nine voting members; that was reduced from nine to seven voting members to help reach a physical quorum. It remained at seven voting members throughout 2020 when the TDLCB met completely virtually under an Executive Order by Governor DeSantis which expired in November 2020. Currently, the TDLCB is holding hybrid meetings with a physical quorum present and the remaining members attending remotely. The suggestion is to reduce the physical quorum requirement from seven voting members to six which represents one-third of the

TDLCB of 18 members. The Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) did not meet their physical quorum earlier today but did discuss the bylaws and make suggestions; under Section F, Parliamentary Procedures, the suggestion was for it to reference the latest edition of Robert's Rules of Order. The other suggestion was to define the number of members on the QAC and Grievance Committee; the number is not specified but can be if this board desires.

Ms. Gahagan commented that for voting purposes, the quorum should be an odd number. She spoke with Mr. Harris about the number of members that sit on the two subcommittees and announced that she would like to sit on the QAC if she can be appointed.

Chairperson Girtman replied that in all likelihood, we would not have a locked vote; she asked if the recommendation is to change the physical quorum requirement from six to an odd number.

Ms. Gahagan replied if staff's recommendation is six, she does not have a problem with it.

Chairperson Girtman stated she is in support of six members for the physical quorum because the COVID-19 numbers are going the wrong direction and she has concerns regarding that. Regarding the suggestion for Robert's Rules, she does not think it hurts to specify the latest edition but it is not referenced that way in any of the county's records that reference Robert's Rules. Naturally, it would be the most recent update and if the board feels that is a necessary descriptor she does not have a problem with it.

Ms. Craig stated the Parliamentary Procedures section of the TDLCB Bylaws does not specifically state the "latest update" but a paperback version costs only about \$10 on Amazon; a copy could be provided to members.

Chairperson Girtman replied the question is if we need to change the language.

Ms. Craig stated she does not think it is necessary; she is a parliamentarian and would not want to be restrictive in the language.

Chairperson Girtman referred to the number of members for the QAC and Grievance Committees and commented it should be open and limited; however, there should be a minimum of at least three members to conduct business.

Mr. Harris replied currently, there are four members on each committee and the number is undefined. Any voting member can join either committee.

Chairperson Girtman asked if it should be modified to read a minimum of three members.

Mr. Harris replied yes.

Ms. Lipovsky asked what the wording is now regarding the QAC.

Mr. Harris replied it is included in Article VIII, Standing Committees, Section A, and reads: "This committee is responsible for the update of the TDLCB Bylaws and coordinates with Votran in reviewing and establishing standards to provide a more efficient system. Reviews include, but are not limited to, the Annual CTC Evaluation and the Annual Operating Report (AOR). Members appointed to this committee shall be voting members of the Coordinating Board." A minimum of three voting members will be required will be added to the current language.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Ms. Craig to approve the TDLCB Bylaws. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lipovsky and carried unanimously.*

E. Review and Approval of the FY 2021/22 TD Rate Model Worksheet

Mr. Harris stated the transportation disadvantaged (TD) rate model worksheet for FY 2021/22 is included in the agenda; for reference purposes, last year's rates are also included. All rates submitted should be developed using the rate calculation model provided by the Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD). The rates are approved by the TDLCB and submitted to the CTD as part of the Trip and Equipment Grant. Mr. Glenn Scorza, Votran, is in attendance to provide further information.

Mr. Scorza stated this annual exercise to complete the TD Rate Model form allows Votran to come up with the unsponsored portion of TD trips that the CTD helps to pay for. The rate model represents the unsponsored portion of those trips.

Ms. Craig asked if the projection was done before we started to have an increase in fuel prices.

Mr. Scorza replied that is a fair assessment; while fuel is a component of these numbers, Votran goes through a cost allocation and fuel is a minor part of that allocation. The expenses that make up the trips are robust in scope and include salaries, benefits, etc.

Ms. Craig asked if it leaves a cushion so that Votran does not go over what is calculated for the year; if a cushion was built in for rising fuel costs.

Mr. Scorza replied no cushion was calculated; they had to work with the actual fuel knowledge at the time.

Ms. Craig asked if something could be added that would give Votran permission to take care of that cost if it goes over the calculation. She asked if that has ever been done before.

Mr. Scorza replied no, not without revisiting the model. He is looking at the cost allocation and he does not see fuel as one of the drivers as to how they came up with the rates; it does not pertain to how the model was arrived at.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Ms. Cerullo to approve the FY 2021/22 TD Rate Model Worksheet. The motion was seconded by Ms. Craig and carried unanimously.*

IV. Presentations and Discussion Items

A. Presentation and Discussion of the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Bus Program

Mr. Harris stated buses are the most widely used form of public transportation in the United States. He showed a short video presentation that describes how the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funds transit buses and bus facilities in more than 3,000 agencies serving cities, rural areas, and tribal lands across the country.

Chairperson Girtman asked if she could get a copy of the video.

Mr. Harris replied yes; it is also provided as a link in the agenda.

V. Staff Comments

→ Update on Votran services during COVID-19 pandemic

Mr. Miller stated fixed route service is holding steady at 76% ridership as compared to 2019. Paratransit ridership was at 43% ridership but in that it has increased to 69% over the last few weeks; they anticipate ridership continuing to increase as the Council on Aging (COA) has begun to schedule more trips. Votran has given out 300,000 masks and is still under a mask mandate; anyone on a bus or in a facility must wear a mask unless they are in an open-air area.

Chairperson Girtman asked if masks and hand sanitizers are still available on the buses for passengers and if the buses are still regularly being disinfected.

Mr. Miller replied yes; and the buses are disinfected regularly.

Ms. Bollenback announced she has submitted notice to the TPO Board that she is stepping down from her position as TPO Executive Director. She expressed her appreciation for those who advocate and serve those who are transportation disadvantaged in Volusia County. During her time at the TPO and at Votran it has been

important to have the ability to serve the community; she knows how hard this board works to serve those who do not have a voice and that they will continue that support in her absence.

Chairperson Girtman thanked Ms. Bollenback for acknowledging the hard work of these volunteers for the community.

VI. TDLCB Member Comments

Ms. Craig stated she has been around for much of Ms. Bollenback's tenure and she has been a wonderful part of this community. She and her staff have done a great deal of work to help support this board.

Mr. Johnson stated he echo's Chairperson Girtman's concerns regarding COVID-19; there has been increase in the number of cases in Volusia County over the last two weeks. These cases have almost been exclusively unvaccinated people. The same goes for hospitalizations; out of 43, only one was a vaccinated person. The cases are rising as a result of the Delta variant. The Health Department is encouraging everyone to stick to mitigation and to get vaccinated.

Chairperson Girtman replied this is a great concern for our community and encouraged members if not vaccinated to do so for their families and to share the concern with others to make our community healthier.

Ms. Lipovsky thanked Ms. Bollenback for her hard work and dedication throughout the years. She commented that earlier in the year it was discussed implementing same day service for paratransit; she asked if there was an update on that.

Mr. Miller replied it is still a work in progress; they are working through how to schedule trips on a same day basis.

VII. TDLCB Chairperson Comments

There were no further Chairperson comments.

VIII. Information Items

- River to Sea TPO Board Meeting Summaries
- River to Sea TPO Outreach & Activities
- River to Sea TPO Planning Grant Quarterly Progress Report
- TDLCB Attendance Record
- TDLCB Interest Form
- TDLCB Membership List
- Votran June Schedule Changes

IX. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:58 a.m.

RIVER TO SEA TRANSPORTATION PLANNING ORGANIZATION

VOLUSIA COUNTY COUNCIL MEMBER BARBARA GIRTMAN, CHAIRPERSON
TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD

CERTIFICATE:

The undersigned, duly qualified and acting Recording Secretary of the River to Sea TPO certifies that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of the minutes of the July 14, 2021 regular meeting of the Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board (TDLCB), approved and duly signed this 13th day of October 2021.


DEBBIE STEWART, RECORDING SECRETARY
RIVER TO SEA TRANSPORTATION PLANNING ORGANIZATION

RIVER TO SEA TPO TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD (TDLCB)

ROLL CALL VOTE SHEET

APPROVAL OF THE 2021 MAJOR UPDATE TO THE TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED SERVICE PLAN (TDSP)

MEETING DATE: JULY 14, 2021
 MEETING TIME: 11:00 A.M.

		YES / NO
FDOT	CARLOS COLON	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
DEPT. OF CHILDREN & FAMILIES	JULIA MARSHALL CHRISTY GILLIS (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMUNITY	BILL HINKLE, JR VACANT (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION SERVICES	CYNTHIA TUCKER SUSAN PAULEY (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VETERANS SERVICES GROUP	ROBERT WATSON RAYMOND ALLEN (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
CITIZENS ADVOCATE	JEAN CERULLO RENEE GAHAGAN (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
DISABLED CITIZENS	JUDY CRAIG MARY TYSON (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
EARLY CHILD CARE	BEVERLY JOHNSON D.J. LEBO (ALT.)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
CITIZENS ADVOCATES, SYSTEM USER	DOUG HALL CASSANDRA JESSIE (ALT.)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ELDERLY CITIZENS	PATRICIA LIPOVSKY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VOLUSIA COUNTY	COUNCIL MEMBER GIRTMAN	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ASSOCIATION OF COMMUNITY ACTION	CLAYTON JACKSON	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ELDER AFFAIRS	GLADYS LACEN DEMENTRA MCKINNEY (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION	VICTORIA ANDERSON IVONNE PEREZ (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
WORK FORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD	ROBIN KING KATHY SPENCER (ALT.)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
MEDICAL COMMUNITY	PATRICIA BOSWELL ETHAN JOHNSON (ALT.)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
PRIVATE FOR PROFIT	STEVE JACK	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
AGENCY FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES	Sheryl Stanford RENEE (HELEN) COOKE SYVIA BAMBURG	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>