

Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board (TDLCB)
Meeting Minutes
April 14, 2021

Volusia County Mobility Management Center
950 Big Tree Road, South Daytona, FL 32119

TDLCB Members Physically Present:

Clayton Jackson
Christy Gillis
Carlos Colón
Patricia Lipovsky
Ethan Johnson
Barbara Girtman, Chairperson
Robert Watson
Kathy Spencer

Representing:

Association of Community Action
Department of Children and Families - Alternate
Florida Department of Transportation
Elderly Citizens
Medical Community - Alternate
Volusia County Council, District 1
Veterans Services Group
Workforce Development Board - Alternate

TDLCB Members Virtually Present:

Doug Hall
Judy Craig, Vice Chairperson
Tamyika Young
Patricia Boswell

Representing:

Citizens Advocate, System User
Disabled Citizens
Health Care Administration - Alternate
Medical Community

TDLCB Members Absent:

Sheryl Dick-Stanford
Beverly Johnson (excused)
Jean Cerullo (excused)
Gladys Lacen
Steve Jack
Bill Hinkle, Jr.
Susan Pauly

Representing:

Agency for Persons with Disabilities
Children at Risk
Citizens Advocate
Elder Affairs
Private for Profit
Public Education
Vocational Rehab Services

Others Physically Present:

Debbie Stewart, Recording Secretary
Stephan Harris
Ramona Goley
Big John
Ralf Heseler
Kelvin Miller
John Cotton
Jake Lunceford

Representing:

TPO Staff
TPO Staff
Citizen
Press
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff
Votran Staff

Others Virtually Present:

Pam Blankenship
Nancy Burgess-Hall

Representing:

TPO Staff
Citizen

I. Call t/o Order / Roll Call / Determination of Quorum/Pledge of Allegiance

Due to the COVID-19 virus, the meeting was held in a hybrid format with eight voting members physically present and four voting members virtually present.

II. Public Comment/Participation

Mr. Big John, press, stated he normally talks about bus stops and benches but that is on the agenda today for the first time. He praised Chairperson Girtman for her determination to have it on the agenda. He referred to the bus stop at the Tomoka Town Center/Tanger Outlet Mall and suggested that those that do not ride the bus go see how far it is from the bus stop to Sam's Club. The bus stop is at the north end of the development and riders would have to cross five lanes of traffic and five intersections to get to Sam's Club. He asked that the TDLCB instruct Votran staff to see what opportunities there are to have more than one bus stop at Tomoka Town Center.

Chairperson Girtman asked if there was only one bus stop there. She commented that she did not think Sam's Club would be a target destination for bus riders unless they were going there to work because it is a bulk store.

Mr. Cotton replied there are two bus stops at Tomoka Town Center; one is at the southern end of the center and a new bus stop was just finished last week right in front of Sam's Club.

III. Consent Agenda

- A. Review and Approval of the October 14, 2020 TDLCB Meeting Minutes**
- B. Review and Approval of the October 14, 2020 TD Public Hearing Minutes**
- C. Review and Approval of the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) Monthly Paratransit Reports**
- D. Review and Approval of the TDLCB Grievance Procedures**
- E. Review and Approval of the 2021 Minor Update to the Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP)**
- F. Review and Approval of the FY 2021/22 Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Section 5310 Grant Application**

The Consent Agenda was approved by a unanimous roll call vote.

IV. Action Items

- A. Review and Approval of the January 13, 2021 TDLCB Meeting Minutes**

MOTION: *A motion was made by Mr. Colón to approve the January 13, 2021 TDLCB meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by and carried unanimously.*

- B. Review and Approval of the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) Monthly Paratransit Reports**

Mr. Harris reviewed the CTC monthly paratransit reports for December 2020, January and February 2021. The previous year's information is also included for comparison purposes. Ridership, trip types, cancellations, revenue miles and revenue hours all showed a dramatic decrease over the prior year; much of the decrease can be contributed to COVID-19.

Mr. Colón asked what "other" meant under the Trip Purpose column.

Mr. Heseler replied it refers to escort or companion trips; a passenger may have a caregiver or an escort rider with them and it would be classified as "other".

MOTION: *A motion was made by Mr. Colón to approve the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) Paratransit Reports. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gillis and carried unanimously.*

C. Review and Approval of the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) FY 2020/21 Evaluation

Mr. Harris stated a link to the CTC Fiscal Year 2020/21 Evaluation was provided in the agenda; the evaluation is performed annually and is straightforward. Some information is carried over from the previous year and is re-verified. One area that can be improved is communication between bus drivers and passengers to prevent missed pick-ups. Votran has responded well to the COVID-19 virus and has taken measures to slow the spread; they have provided personal protective equipment and hand sanitizer to ensure all passengers are comfortable and well protected against the virus. An on-site observation of the system was also conducted as part of the evaluation. He, Mr. Colón and Ms. Cerullo rode on a paratransit bus and noted the condition of the vehicle and bus driver. Excellent service was provided and the driver was very knowledgeable and helpful. The manifest from the on-site observation is also included in the evaluation.

MOTION: *A motion was made by Mr. Watson to approve the Community Transportation Coordinator's (CTC) FY 2020/21 Evaluation. The motion was seconded by Mr. Johnson and carried unanimously.*

IV. Presentations and Discussion Items

A. Presentation and Discussion of Votran Short Term Efficiencies

Mr. Miller gave a PowerPoint presentation of Votran short term efficiencies; they looked at all the bus routes to find ways to make the system more efficient. They are proposing changes to three routes that will result in \$224,718 in savings to the general fund. Those proposed changes are to eliminate Route 25, Howland Boulevard, which was suspended under COVID-19 due to low ridership; convert Route 24 to Seville/Pierson to transportation disadvantaged (TD) trips; and to replace the Fixed Route 44, SR 44 in New Smyrna Beach, with Flex service. He explained why these changes were proposed and the alternative methods of providing service to these areas. He reviewed the advantages of these changes and the savings; by converting Route 24 to TD trips, Votran will be able to utilize TD grant funds. Before making this proposal, Mr. Lunceford and Mr. Heseler went to the Seville/Pierson area and held a public meeting; they spoke with people, conducted a survey and received feedback. The proposed changes were well received.

Mr. Harris asked if Votran expected the proposed changes to become effective in June.

Mr. Miller replied yes, by the second week in June. There will be public hearings in Pierson on April 21, 2021 and in New Smyrna Beach on April 22, 2021.

B. Presentation and Discussion of Votran Bus Stops

Mr. Cotton gave a PowerPoint presentation of Votran's bus stops. Votran operates 28 daytime routes; 7 nighttime routes; 6 Sunday routes; Flex service in New Smyrna Beach as well as paratransit Gold service. There is a total of 2,378 bus stops in Volusia County, of which, 403 are considered Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant. The Federal Transit Administration (FTA) defines a bus stop as a sign and a post in a safe location for both riders and buses to engage; and that if a bus alighting and boarding area is present, it must be in accordance with the ADA. Bus stops installed prior to 1992 and

the ADA are grandfathered in. Bus stop design guidelines for Florida are provided in the handbook "Accessing Transit" which was most recently updated in 2017. Votran considers the following when looking for a bus stop location: safety, security, traffic flow and system performance; if the bus will be on time, traffic flow, are there crosswalks, etc. There are many different factors that go into a bus stop; for example, bus stop signs should be unique to other signs. Votran uses a square post with dimples so that the visually impaired will know they are at a bus stop. New stops must be ADA compliant with an accessible pad that is eight-foot deep and five-foot wide and provide for water drainage. If a bus stop installed prior to 1992 and the stop is altered, it must be brought up to ADA compliance. He reviewed the four types of stops Votran builds and challenges to bus stop placement or improvements. He reviewed the costs of a bus stop from the basic ADA pad at \$10,000; a bus stop with a shelter is \$27,000 while a bus stop with a bench is \$12,000. A stop may also include an ADA accessible path which costs \$74 per linear foot.

Mr. Cotton continued the presentation and stated the ADA does not require that a bench or shelter be placed at a bus stop; however, if such an amenity is placed as a courtesy feature by the transit system or municipality, it must meet all ADA requirements for its placement and structure. A developer may include a bench or shelter at a stop but it will belong to them, not Votran and they are responsible for maintenance. Amenities such as benches and shelters can be placed via contract with an outdoor advertising firm which would be responsible for maintenance and repairs. He reviewed the required specifications for benches and shelters; he noted shelters are more expensive in Florida because they must be hurricane reinforced. Florida code states a shelter may be erected only at bus stops designated as having service a minimum number of 10 times per day in a five-day period. He noted the city of Daytona Beach and Holly Hill had contracted with outdoor advertising companies that did not provide ADA compliant benches or shelters; municipalities must be diligent and include ADA compliance requirements in agreements they make with the outdoor advertising companies. He noted that the City of Ormond Beach has taken responsibility for their shelter maintenance. He explained some shelters that have been vandalized and damaged in the area including one at Sun Splash Park and one in Ormond Beach.

Mr. Harris asked if the vandalized shelters have been repaired or replaced.

Mr. Cotton replied the city of Ormond Beach cleaned up the broken glass and framework so that the shelter is no longer a safety issue but it has not been completely repaired. Votran replaced the shelter at Sun Splash Park at a cost of \$9,000; \$6,000 for the shelter and \$3,000 for labor.

Ms. Gillis asked if the agreements with the cities were a blanket agreement or for specific bus stops.

Mr. Cotton replied it varies; Edgewater has only two stops and they maintain them. When the SR 44 route started, the agreement with New Smyrna Beach included all the stops along SR 44.

Chairperson Girtman asked if Votran has considered which bus stop locations could have benches or shelters to meet the need for areas that have high utilization.

Mr. Cotton replied it is an ongoing project; they take a route and pull out the attractors for that route and see what the ridership is.

Chairperson Girtman asked how long before he can provide some recommendations.

Mr. Cotton replied before the next TDLCB meeting.

Chairperson Girtman thanked him for a thorough report and commented now we need the options, alternatives and a funding source.

Mr. Jackson referred to the bus stops that were grandfathered in that were built prior to the ADA and asked if Votran receives any complaints.

Mr. Cotton replied no; there was a separate legal issue in 2015 that mentioned some but Votran received guidance from the county and upgraded them. The cities are slowly coming on board; Ponce Inlet recently upgraded their stops on their own. Deltona and Orange City are working on it.

V. Staff Comments

→ Update on Constant Contact Newsletter

Ms. Blankenship announced the TPO's first Constant Contact newsletter went out at the end of last month; it was also posted on Facebook and Twitter. She asked if members had suggestions for future newsletter articles to please let her know.

→ Update on Microsoft Teams

Ms. Blankenship announced the TPO will be switching the virtual meeting platform in May from GoToMeeting to Microsoft Teams to be ADA compliant so that it can be used with screen readers and have closed captioning. More information will be forthcoming.

→ Update on Votran services during COVID-19 pandemic

Mr. Heseler stated Votran has maintained the status quo regarding COVID-19 practices; they continue to sanitize the vehicles daily and enforce the FTA mask mandate for passengers while on board. They also continue to provide masks and hand sanitizer to passengers and maintain social distance while providing efficient service.

VI. TDLCB Member Comments

Ms. Craig referred to the new medical clinic in West Volusia and the bus stop there; it is not a safe location for a stop.

Chairperson Girtman agreed and commented she would like to see alternative services used there as she is concerned about safety.

Ms. Craig stated the stop is across the street from the facility and is very unsafe. The problem may be solved by encouraging use of Votran Gold paratransit service; she will make a report to the West Volusia Hospital Authority.

VII. TDLCB Chairperson Comments

There were no further Chairperson comments.

VIII. Information Items

- River to Sea TPO Board Meeting Summaries
- River to Sea TPO Outreach & Activities

- River to Sea TPO Planning Grant Quarterly Progress Report
- TDLCB Attendance Record
- TDLCB Interest Form
- TDLCB Membership List

IX. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:08 p.m.

RIVER TO SEA TRANSPORTATION PLANNING ORGANIZATION



**VOLUSIA COUNTY COUNCIL MEMBER BARBARA GIRTMAN, CHAIRPERSON
TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD**

CERTIFICATE:

The undersigned, duly qualified and acting Recording Secretary of the River to Sea TPO certifies that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of the minutes of the April 14, 2021 regular meeting of the Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board (TDLCB), approved and duly signed this 14th day of July 2021.



**DEBBIE STEWART, RECORDING SECRETARY
RIVER TO SEA TRANSPORTATION PLANNING ORGANIZATION**

RIVER TO SEA TPO TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD (TDLCB)

12:23

ROLL CALL VOTE SHEET

APPROVAL OF THE ANNUAL UPDATE TO THE TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED SERVICE PLAN (TDSP)

MEETING DATE: APRIL 14, 2021

MEETING TIME: 11:00 A.M.

		YES / NO
FDOT	CARLOS COLON	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
DEPT. OF CHILDREN & FAMILIES	JULIA MARSHALL	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	CHRISTY GILLIS (ALT)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
PUBLIC EDUCATION COMMUNITY	BILL HINKLE, JR	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	VACANT (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION SERVICES	CYNTHIA TUCKER	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	SUSAN PAULEY (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VETERANS SERVICES GROUP	ROBERT WATSON	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	RAYMOND ALLEN (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
CITIZENS ADVOCATE	JEAN CERULLO	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	RENEE GAHAGAN (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
DISABLED CITIZENS	JUDY CRAIG	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
EARLY CHILD CARE	BEVERLY JOHNSON	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	D.J. LEBO (ALT.)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
CITIZENS ADVOCATES, SYSTEM USER	DOUG HALL	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	VACANT (ALT.)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ELDERLY CITIZENS	PATRICIA LIPOVSKY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
VOLUSIA COUNTY	COUNCIL MEMBER GIRTMAN	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ASSOCIATION OF COMMUNITY ACTION	CLAYTON JACKSON	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
ELDER AFFAIRS	GLADYS LACEN	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	DEMENTRA MCKINNEY (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION	SHELISHA COLEMAN	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	TAMYIKA YOUNG (ALT)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
WORK FORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD	ROBIN KING	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	KATHY SPENCER (ALT.)	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
MEDICAL COMMUNITY	PATRICIA BOSWELL	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	ETHAN JOHNSON(ALT.)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
PRIVATE FOR PROFIT	STEVE JACK	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
AGENCY FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES	RENEE (HELEN) COOKE	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>
	SYVIA BAMBURG	<input type="checkbox"/> / <input type="checkbox"/>



April 12 2021

MEDIA CONTACT: Kate Sark
Volusia County Community Information
386-822-5062, ext. 12246

Votran plans public meetings to discuss schedule changes

Votran has two public meetings scheduled to inform residents of upcoming service changes that may impact some users. Meetings are planned from 11 a.m. to 2 p.m. and 4 to 6:30 p.m. Wednesday, April 21, at the Pierson Community Center, 124 W. Washington Ave.; and from 11 a.m. to 2 p.m. and 4 to 6:30 p.m. Thursday, April 22, at the Brannon Center, 105 S. Riverside Drive, New Smyrna Beach.

Meetings will focus on upcoming service changes in West Volusia and New Smyrna Beach. Changes are being implemented based off direction by the Volusia County Council during the March 16 County Council meeting.

Both meetings will be in an open house format and attendees may arrive at any time within the designated meeting timeframe. Spanish-speaking staff will be on-site at the Pierson meeting. A paratransit vehicle will be on-site at both meetings so that the public can familiarize themselves with the vehicle that will service the area.

For more information about the meetings and upcoming service changes, select the "Contact Us" tab on Votran.org or call 386-756-7496, ext. 4009.

—30—